Low Temperature Emission Control to Enable Fuel-Efficient Engine Commercialization

Todd Toops(PI), Eleni Kyriakidou, Andrew Binder, Jae-Soon Choi, Jim Parks, Michael Lance

Oak Ridge National Laboratory

Sponsors: Gurpreet Singh, Ken Howden, and Leo Breton Advanced Combustion Engines Program U.S. Department of Energy

ACE085 June 9, 2016

This presentation does not contain any proprietary, confidential, or otherwise restricted information

ORNL is managed by UT-Battelle for the US Department of Energy



Project Overview

Timeline

- Year 1 of 3-year program*
- Builds on previous R&D in FY13-FY15

Partners

- Low Temperature Aftertreatment Sub-Team of US DRIVE Advanced Combustion and Emission Control Tech Team
- Johnson Matthey (Haiying Chen)
- BES-funded scientists
- NSF-funded scientists/students University of South Carolina
- Karlsruhe Institute of Technology

Budget

• FY2016: \$400k (Task 1*)

*Task 1: Low Temperature Emission Control

Part of large ORNL project "Enabling Fuel Efficient Engines by Controlling Emissions" (2015 VTO AOP Lab Call)

Barriers

- From DOE Vehicle Technologies Multi-Year Program Plan (2011-2015)
 - 2.3.1.B: Lack of cost-effective emission control
 - 2.3.1.D: Durability
- Overall, addressing emission compliance barrier to market for advanced fuel-efficient engine technologies



Objectives and Relevance

Develop new emission control technologies to enable fuel-efficient engines with low exhaust temperatures (<150°C) to meet emission regulations Goal: 90% Conversion at 150°C

BAMA ADMINISTRATION Fuel Economy Standards

\$8,200

Consumers will have saved TRILLION

6 billion metric tons

Economy

National Laboratory

- Greater combustion efficiency lowers exhaust temperature
- Catalysis is challenging at low temperatures
- Emissions standards getting more stringent



Combustion mode] vs. Conventional Diesel Combustion (CDC)

Relevance: Guiding Documents Define Needs



Clean Diesel Combustion (CDC)



Approach: employ low temperature protocols to evaluate novel catalysts

- Protocols finalized in June 2015 by the Low Temperature Aftertreatment Sub-Team of the US DRIVE Advanced Combustion and Emission Control Team
- Full file at: <u>www.CLEERS.org</u>

Total HC: 3000 ppm C_2H_4 : 1667 ppm C_3H_6 : 1000 ppm C₃H₈: 333 ppm CO: 2000 ppm NO: 100 ppm H_2 : 400 ppm 6 % H_2O : CO_2 : 6 % O_2 : 12 % Balance N₂

Powder Catalyst Requirements

- Reactor ID 3-13 mm
- Catalyst particle size
 ≤ 0.25 mm (60 mesh)
- Catalyst bed L/D ≥ 1
- Space velocity
 - 200-400 L/g-hr
 - For 0.1 g sample, flow 333-666 sccm



Approach: identify candidates through independent research and collaborations with NSF- and BES-funded scientists

- Initial data* from U. South Carolina shows good CO and propylene (not shown) activity
 - simple conditions, not full protocol
 - MC: MnO_x-CeO₂
 - SMC: SnO₂-MnO_x-CeO₂
 - Also evaluated with 1% Pd

 Through a collaboration, catalysts evaluated under LTC-D protocol



Approach: identify candidates through independent research and collaborations with NSF- and BES-funded scientists

- Initial data* from U. South Carolina shows good CO and propylene (not shown) activity
 - simple conditions, not full protocol
 - MC: MnO_x-CeO₂
 - SMC: SnO₂-MnO_x-CeO₂
 - Also evaluated with 1% Pd

- Through a collaboration, catalysts evaluated under LTC-D protocol
 - For MC, CO and C₃H₆ reactivity muted, but good for a PGM-free catalyst
 - In general, hydrocarbon activity is promising



Approach: identify candidates through independent research and collaborations with NSF- and BES-funded scientists

- Initial data* from U. South Carolina shows good CO and propylene (not shown) activity
 - simple conditions, not full protocol
 - MC: MnO_x-CeO₂

8

- SMC: SnO₂-MnO_x-CeO₂
- Also evaluated with 1% Pd

- Through a collaboration, catalysts evaluated under LTC-D protocol
 - For MC, CO and C₃H₆ reactivity muted, but good for a PGM-free catalyst
 - In general, hydrocarbon activity is promising
 - Improves further with Pd addition
- Protocols helping to elucidate strengths and weaknesses of catalysts being evaluated



Collaborations

- DOE Basic Energy Sciences Program
 - Sheng Dai and Steve Overbury (ORNL), Center for Nanophase Material Science (ORNL)
- CLEERS
 - Dissemination of data; presentation at CLEERS workshop
- Academia
 - University of South Carolina
 - Professors John Regalbuto, Jochen Lauterbach and Erdem Sasmaz
 - International collaborations
 - UPMC, France (Dr. Cyril Thomas) & CNU, Korea (Prof. Sang-Wook Han), Karlsruhe Institute of Technology

• Industry

- USCAR/USDRIVE ACEC Tech Team Catalyst Sub-Team
 - low temperature evaluation protocols
- Catalyst and washcoat suppliers
 - Johnson Matthey: Industry input from Haiying Chen
 - **Solvay:** alumina-based supports provided for PGM support studies at USC (Barry Southward)

Other DOE-funded FOA Projects

- Ford-led project: Next Generation Three-Way Catalysts for Future, Highly Efficient Gasoline Engines
 - Catalysts being investigated for stoichiometric applications
- **UCONN**-led project: Metal Oxide Nano-Array Catalysts for Low Temperature Diesel Oxidation



Milestones

FY15 Milestones:

- {Key SMART milestone} Investigate individual roles of the components in the CuCoCe ternary oxide and potential synergies with standard emissions control components (12/31/2014) complete
- Identify candidate materials for NH₃ SCR catalysts that are active at low temperatures (9/30/2015) *complete*
 - Intended as an identification of catalysts being studied in the literature and through fundamental studies, not as an experimental campaign
 - Identified MnOx-based catalysts to be the only materials to show significant activity below 150°C...as low as 110-120°C [1,2]; concerns regarding thermal durability.

FY16 Milestones: on track

 Report on evaluation of CCC+PGM emissions control studies including implementation of full ACEC low temperature protocol (9/30/2016).

[1] G. Qi, R.T. Yang, "Performance and kinetics study for low-temperature SCR of NO with NH_3 over MnO_x -CeO₂ catalyst," Journal of Catalysis 217 (2003) 434-441. [2] P.G. Smirniotis, P.M. Sreekanth, D.A. Peña, R.G. Jenkins, "Manganese Oxide Catalysts Supported on TiO₂, Al₂O₃, and SiO₂: A comparison for Low-Temperature SCR of NO with NH_3 ," Industrial & Engineering Chemistry Research 45 (2006) 6436-6443.



Technical Accomplishments

PGM-free mixed metal oxides

- Identified new mixed metal oxide candidate (USC) that has improved HC activity (Sn-Mn-Ce and Mn-Ce)
- Measured sulfur tolerance of CCC while also exploring mitigation strategies with PGM
- Support modifications for enhanced PGM activity
 - New core@shell technique employed to maximize ZrO₂ surface for PGM catalysis shown to yield improved activity especially for THC
 - Successfully implemented nano-on-nano technique with Pd dispersed on nanoparticles of Ce-Zr dispersed on Al₂O₃; high activity observed, approaching targets for some gases
- Trapping materials
 - Determined key attributes of silver-alumina HC trap; deep ion exchange and low Si:Al
 - Demonstrated NO adsorption on Pd/ZSM-5; impact of pretreatment temperature



Mixed metal oxide has shown interesting chemistry and some promise without PGM

- CuO_x -CoO_y-CeO_z (CCC) promising for CO oxidation
 - Interfacing crystalline regions of Co_3O_4 and CeO_2
 - Cu in lattices of both Co_3O_4 and CeO_2 evenly
 - CO oxidation unaffected by HC
- Need additional catalyst for low-temp. HC oxidation
 - Aids HC oxidation over Pt/Al₂O₃ in physical mixture







Inclusion of PGM improves sulfur tolerance and sulfur removal of CCC

- Employed ACEC protocol for sulfur poisoning
 - Flow 5 ppm SO₂ at 300°C for 5 hours
 - -200 L/g-hr (GHSV ~300,000 h⁻¹)
 - Dense catalyst results in small volume
- Significant deactivation observed if Pt/Al₂O₃ not included



Inclusion of PGM improves sulfur tolerance and sulfur removal of CCC

- Employed ACEC protocol for sulfur poisoning
 - Flow 5 ppm SO_2 at 300°C for 5 hours
 - 200 L/g-hr (GHSV ~300,000 h⁻¹)
 - Dense catalyst results in small volume
- Significant deactivation observed if Pt/ Al₂O₃ not included
- After sulfation, ramp under LTC-D conditions to investigate full reactivity
- Desulfation attempted at 600°C under cycling lean and rich conditions
 - $-10\%~O_2$ and $1\%~H_2$
 - 30 seconds each, 30 minutes total
- Results show the presence of Pt help protect/recover activity of the catalysts
 - Unclear if CCC has role as desulfated evaluation behaves similar to Pt/Al₂O₃



Inclusion of PGM improves sulfur tolerance and sulfur removal of CCC

- Employed ACEC protocol for sulfur poisoning
 - Flow 5 ppm SO_2 at 300°C for 5 hours
 - 200 L/g-hr (GHSV ~300,000 h⁻¹)
 - Dense catalyst results in small volume
- Significant deactivation observed if Pt/ Al₂O₃ not included
- After sulfation, ramp under LTC-D conditions to investigate full reactivity
- Desulfation attempted at 600°C under cycling lean and rich conditions
 - $-10\%~O_2$ and $1\%~H_2$
 - 30 seconds each, 30 minutes total
- Results show the presence of Pt help protect/recover activity of the catalysts
 - Unclear if CCC has role as desulfated evaluation behaves similar to Pt/Al₂O₃



Technical Accomplishments

PGM-free mixed metal oxides

- Identified new mixed metal oxide candidate (USC) that has improved HC activity (Sn-Mn-Ce and Mn-Ce)
- Measured sulfur tolerance of CCC while also exploring mitigation strategies with PGM
- Support modifications for enhanced PGM activity
 - New core@shell technique employed to maximize ZrO₂ surface for PGM catalysis shown to yield improved activity especially for THC
 - Successfully implemented nano-on-nano technique with Pd dispersed on nanoparticles of Ce-Zr dispersed on Al₂O₃; high activity observed, approaching targets for some gases
- Trapping materials
 - Determined key attributes of silver-alumina HC trap; deep ion exchange and low Si:Al
 - Demonstrated NO adsorption on Pd/ZSM-5; impact of pretreatment temperature

ZrO₂ support has shown excellent activity with Pd catalyst; efforts to improve ongoing

Pd/ZrO₂ has good activity, excellent thermal durability, good S tolerance

 ZrO_2 -SiO_2 mixed oxide

tional Laboratory

Si₀

- Goal: further improve activity and sulfur tolerance
 - Support ZrO₂ on high surface area SiO₂
- Initial effort not successful as Pd/ZrO₂ still more active
 - not a monolayer; 15% coverage of SiO₂ surface
 - Pd dispersed on both ZrO₂ and SiO₂



17 ACE085 Kim et al. Applied Catalysis B: Environmental 187 (2016) 181–194.

 Able to synthesize a complete shell around SiO₂ core using new technique SiO₂@Pd/ZrO₂
 ZrO₂-SiO₂ mixed oxide





This research was performed, in part, using instrumentation (FEI Talos F200X S/TEM) provided by the Department of Energy, Office of Nuclear Energy, Fuel Cycle R&D Program and the Nuclear Science User Facilities.

- Able to synthesize a complete shell around SiO₂ core using new technique SiO₂@Pd/ZrO₂
 ZrO₂-SiO₂ mixed oxide
 - Pd (1 wt%) deposition solely on ZrO₂ outer shell





This research was performed, in part, using instrumentation (FEI Talos F200X S/TEM) provided by the Department of Energy, Office of Nuclear Energy, Fuel Cycle R&D Program and the Nuclear Science User Facilities.

- Able to synthesize a complete shell around SiO₂ core using new technique SiO₂@Pd/ZrO₂
 ZrO₂-SiO₂ mixed oxide
 - Pd (1 wt%) deposition solely on ZrO₂ outer shell
- While employing ACEC low temperature protocols improved activity shown with this technique







This research was performed, in part, using instrumentation (FEI Talos F200X S/TEM) provided by the Department of Energy, Office of Nuclear Energy, Fuel Cycle R&D Program and the Nuclear Science User Facilities.

- Able to synthesize a complete shell around SiO₂ core using new technique SiO₂@Pd/ZrO₂
 - Pd (1 wt%) deposition solely on ZrO₂ outer shell
- While employing ACEC low temperature protocols improved activity shown with this technique
- Robust after aging at 900°C for 10h
 - Improved initial dispersion technique still needed







This research was performed, in part, using instrumentation (FEI Talos F200X S/TEM) provided by the Department of Energy, Office of Nuclear Energy, Fuel Cycle R&D Program and the Nuclear Science User Facilities.

Targeted PGM deposition on Ce-Zr nanoparticles also investigated

- Starting with CeZr nanoparticles, ~5 nm, anchor them to high surface area supports
 - In this instance AI_2O_3 , but SiO_2 also possible
- Target Pd deposition on preferred supported metal oxide
 - nano-particles of PGM on nano-particles of Ce-Zr
 - Controlling pH enables targeted deposition
- It is possible...



Pd NPs





This research was performed, in part, using instrumentation (FEI Talos F200X S/TEM) provided by the Department of Energy, Office of Nuclear Energy, Fuel Cycle R&D Program and the Nuclear Science User Facilities.

Pd/Ce-Zr/Al₂O₃ catalysts show promise

Conversion (%)

- Good activity being observed
 - Degreened, 4wt.% Pd/Ce-Zr/Al₂O₃
 - Pd nano-particles on Ce-Zr nano-particles
 - Also, tolerant to hydrothermal aging
 - THC oxidation improves after 900°C
- However, meeting 150°C target still challenging, especially for C₂H₄ & C₃H₈



Pd/Zr only has 1% Pd



Technical Accomplishments

PGM-free mixed metal oxides

- Identified new mixed metal oxide candidate (USC) that has improved HC activity (Sn-Mn-Ce and Mn-Ce)
- Measured sulfur tolerance of CCC while also exploring mitigation strategies with PGM
- Support modifications for enhanced PGM activity
 - New core@shell technique employed to maximize ZrO₂ surface for PGM catalysis shown to yield improved activity especially for THC
 - Successfully implemented nano-on-nano technique with Pd dispersed on nanoparticles of Ce-Zr dispersed on Al₂O₃; high activity observed, approaching targets for some gases

Trapping materials

- Determined key attributes of silver-alumina HC trap; deep ion exchange and low Si:Al
- Demonstrated NO adsorption on Pd/ZSM-5; impact of pretreatment temperature

Ion-exchanging and Ag loading key factors in HC adsorption in the presence of H₂O



500 ppm HC (C₁ basis), 200 ppm NO, 200 ppm CO



- NO does not adsorb significantly
- C₃H₆ adsorption requires ionexchanged sites in the zeolite
- Higher Ag loading results in higher C₃H₆ adsorption/ desorption

National Laboratory

Release is complicated

Release profile indicates significant reactivity of stored HC and varies with Ag loading



DGE

National Laboratory

Release profile indicates significant reactivity of stored HC and varies with Ag loading



C₃H₆ is released mainly as HCs followed by smaller amounts of CO₂ and CO. Ag/BEA

National Laboratory

The desorption T of C₃H₆ is lower for lower Ag loading.



Pd/ZSM-5 stores both NO and HC; pretreatment temperature affects NO release



CCC also shows the ability to store and release **NO** at low temperatures while flowing full simulated exhaust streams



30 ACE085

Remaining Challenges

PGM-free mixed metal oxides

Overall activity needs to be improved, especially for hydrocarbons

Sulfur tolerance needs to be improved and strategies for removal need to be identified

Future Directions

Identify and increase active sites on CCC through systematic synthesis; expand collaboration w/USC (Sn-Mn-Ce oxide)

Investigate S interactions in physical mixture w/ PGM catalyst; find minimum PGM needed to mitigate S impact

Support modifications for enhanced PGM activity

Overall activity needs to be improved, especially for C_2H_4 and C_3H_8

Sulfur tolerance has not been demonstrated on new samples

Trapping Materials

Trapping efficiency needs to be improved for both NO and HC

Demonstration of effectiveness when mixed with oxidation catalysts has not been shown Initial dispersion of PGM to be improved; new techniques (precursor, pH, reduction step); **Begin Pt + Pd + Rh studies**

Implement ACEC S protocol for new samples; initial samples showed good recovery at low temperatures

Increase active sites w/ higher loadings and more complete ion-exchange

Explore effectiveness with best catalysts from other areas; implement new ACEC trapping protocols (when published)



Responses to 2015 Reviewers (3)

- Approach (3.67/4.0): steps taken are logical ...process and techniques of evaluating the material are excellent ...[need to] expose the candidate catalysts to hydrothermal aging and sulfur poisoning ... exhaust approach and test protocol critical to move into practical application
- <u>Technical Accomplishments (3.33/4.0)</u>: very high caliber work ... new approach delivering results, good start ... begun the SCR work but show no plans or data ... findings have been very insightful ... more involvement from catalyst suppliers would be sensible ... sulfur exposure on the CCC catalysts
- <u>Collaborations (3.33/4.0)</u>: collaborators have the needs covered, excellent ... more regular technical interactions with industrial partners ... reaching out to additional catalyst suppliers could be beneficial
- Future plans (3.33/4.0): future work was clear and consistent with the remaining challenges and the overall target path.... sound technical path forward ... sulfur studies are very critical for CCC and long overdue ... effect of sulfur should be the top priority.... design of experiment technique should be considered to speed up the project
- **<u>Relevance (100%)</u>**: addresses a key enabling issue with regards to low-temperature combustion engine technology ... low-temperature catalysts with high efficiencies and durability is a critical enabler for advanced engine technologies
- <u>Resources (33% Insufficient):</u> resources sufficient for HC/CO oxidation work, but likely not enough for SCR work ... much on HC remediation, unless more resources are added, the project will miss the NH₃ SCR goals

Responsive Actions

- 1. <u>Sulfur</u> exposure and hydrothermal aging being implemented
- 2. New ACEC protocols have been fully integrated into project
- 1. Effort on SCR last FY was literature review not experimental work
- 2. Will work to engage more suppliers, especially as promising technologies are identified for fully-formulated samples
- 3. <u>Sulfur</u> now studied on CCC
- Added more partners; will engage more
 ...and catalyst suppliers
- 1. Aging studies being performed on CCC with <u>sulfur</u>
- 2. will introduce <u>sulfur</u> to adsorbers
- 3. will consider design of experiments
- 1. Partnering with several universities, and are aligning their fundamental studies to address challenges of low temperature catalysts
- 2. *NH*₃-SCR evaluation not currently planned



Summary

- <u>Relevance</u>: These studies are targeted towards providing data and predictive tools to address gaps in information needed to enable increased use of biofuels
- <u>Approach</u>: Targeted, engine-based and flow-reactor studies with in-depth characterization of PM, HCs, and emissions control devices to better understand fuel and lubricant effects
- <u>Collaborations</u>: Wide-ranging collaboration with industry, academia, and national labs maximizes breadth of study and guides research from other funding sources
- <u>Technical Accomplishments</u>:
 - Identified new mixed metal oxide candidates (USC) that have improved HC activity
 - Measured sulfur tolerance of CCC while also exploring mitigation strategies with PGM
 - New core@shell technique employed to maximize ZrO₂ surface for PGM catalysis shown to yield improved activity especially for THC
 - Successfully implemented nano-on-nano technique with Pd dispersed on nanoparticles of Ce-Zr dispersed on Al₂O₃; high activity observed, approaching targets for some gases
 - Determined key attributes of silver-alumina HC trap; deep ion exchange and low Si:Al
 - Demonstrated NO adsorption on Pd/ZSM-5; impact of pretreatment temperature
- <u>Future Work</u>: expanding effort with new materials to increase active sites and understand interactions with sulfur; increased implementation of multi-component beds and Pt+Pd catalysts



Technical Backup Slides



Evaluating Mn, Ce and Sn with good durability and HC oxidation

- Collaboration with U. South Carolina (USC)
 - MC: MnO_x-CeO₂
 - SMC: SnO₂-MnO_x-CeO₂
 - Also evaluated with 1% Pd
- Catalysts show good HC activity and durability
 - C. Wang et al. Catalysis Today 258 (2015) 481–486





Evaluating Mn, Ce and Sn with good durability and HC oxidation

- Collaboration with U. South Carolina (USC)
 - MC: MnO_x-CeO₂
 - SMC: SnO₂-MnO_x-CeO₂
 - Also evaluated with 1% Pd
- Catalysts show good HC activity and durability
 - C. Wang et al. Catalysis Today 258 (2015) 481–486
- Evaluated at ORNL with LTC-D protocol
 - Conditions more challenging, but improved HC reactivity observed w/o Pd
 - Efforts for improvement continuing at USC



National Laboratory

Evaluating Mn, Ce and Sn with good durability and HC oxidation

- Collaboration with U. South Carolina (USC)
 - MC: MnO_x-CeO₂
 - SMC: SnO₂-MnO_x-CeO₂
 - Also evaluated with 1% Pd
- Catalysts show good HC activity and durability
 - C. Wang et al. Catalysis Today 258 (2015) 481–486
- Evaluated at ORNL with LTC-D protocol
 - Conditions more challenging, but improved HC reactivity observed w/o Pd
 - Efforts for improvement continuing at USC



CCC as a component in a PGM-containing system lowers the HC light-off temperature

- Pt deposited on CCC shows less activity than Pt/Al₂O₃
 - But better than CCC
- CCC in front of Pt/Al₂O₃ improves C_3H_6 oxidation
- Mixing CCC with Pt/Al₂O₃ gives best C_3H_6 activity

Still need additional improvements to get to lower light off temperatures



 Pt/Al_2O_3

Pt/CCC

Observed exotherm is highest with Pt/Al₂O₃ + CCC





Trapping for low temperature emissions control



National Laboratory

Kim, M.-Y., <u>Kyriakidou, E.A.</u>, Choi, J.-S., Toops, T.J., Binder, A.J., Thomas, C., Parks, J.E.,
Schard, S., Chen, J., Hensley, D.K., Submitted to Appl. Catal. B: Environ. (09/2015).
Nunan, J., Lupescu, J., Denison, G., Ball, D., Moser, D., SAE Int. J. Fuels Lubr., 6 (2013) 430.

Zeolites can be effective traps that have variable material properties

- Understand zeolites in HC and NO adsorption and desorption study to help optimize processes
- Systematic variation of key zeolite properties:
 - Cation type (H⁺ vs. Ag⁺)
 - H₂O, CO₂, NO
 - Acidity (low vs. high SiO₂/Al₂O₃)
 - Metal loading

Ion-Exchanged Zeolites.





Retain olefins
 and aromatics
 at low T.
 Resistance to

water adsorption.

Loading: 0, 1, 5 wt.% Calcination: 500-750°C (2 h)

Nunan, J., Lupescu, J., Denison, G., Ball, D., Moser, D., SAE Int. J. Fuels Lubr. 6 (2013) 430.



Zeolites can be effective traps that have variable material properties

- Understand zeolites in HC and NO adsorption and desorption study to help optimize processes
- Systematic variation of key zeolite properties:
 - Cation type (H⁺ vs. Ag⁺)
 - H₂O, CO₂, NO
 - Acidity (low vs. high SiO₂/Al₂O₃)
 - Metal loading

Ion-Exchanged Zeolites.





Loading: 0, 1, 5 wt.% Calcination: 500-750°C (2 h)

Liu, X., Lambert, J.K., Arendarskiia, D.A., Farrauto, R.J., Appl. Catal. B 35 (2001) 125. Lambert, J.K., Deeba, M., Farrauto, R.J, US Patent 6,074,973 (2000). Nunan, J., Lupescu, J., Denison, G., Ball, D., Moser, D., SAE Int. J. Fuels Lubr. 6 (2013) 430.



Zeolites can be effective traps that have variable material properties

- Understand zeolites in HC and NO adsorption and desorption study to help optimize processes
- Systematic variation of key zeolite properties:
 - Cation type (H⁺ vs. Ag⁺)
 - H₂O, CO₂, NO
 - Acidity (low vs. high SiO₂/Al₂O₃)
 - Metal loading

Ion-Exchanged Zeolites.



 Retain olefins and aromatics at low T.
 Resistance to water adsorption.

Loading: 0, 1, 5 wt.% Calcination: 500-750°C (2 h)

Zeolite type	SiO ₂ /Al ₂ O ₃ molar ratio	Nominal cation form	Surface Area (m²/g)
Beta	25	H⁺	680
Beta	25	Ag+	NM
ZSM-5	30	Pd ²⁺	NM

Liu, X., Lambert, J.K., Arendarskiia, D.A., Farrauto, R.J., Appl. Catal. B 35 (2001) 125. Lambert, J.K., Deeba, M., Farrauto, R.J, US Patent 6,074,973 (2000). Nunan, J., Lupescu, J., Denison, G., Ball, D., Moser, D., SAE Int. J. Fuels Lubr. 6 (2013) 430.

